# Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis

Annual Actuarial Valuation as of October 1, 2023



# **Table of Contents**

Section	Page	_
	1-4	Introduction
	5-9	Risks Associated with Measuring the Present Value of Future Benefits and Contributions
	10-11	Low-Default-Risk Obligation Measure
Α		Actuarial Valuation Results and Asset Information
	1-6	Summary of Actuarial Valuation Results
	7-8	Fund Balance Split
В		Data Reflecting Plan Membership
	1	Total Membership
	2	Active Non-DROP Member Data
	3	Active DROP Member Data
	4-8	Inactive Members in Payment Status
С		Actuarial Valuation Procedures
	1	Actuarial Cost Method
	2-9	Actuarial Assumptions
	10-14	Summary of Plan Provisions



i



January 18, 2024

The Pension Board Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis 1601 South Broadway St. Louis, Missouri 63104

Dear Board Members:

We are pleased to present the report of the actuarial valuation of the Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis ("FRS" or "System") as of October 1, 2023. This actuarial valuation was prepared at your request and is intended for use by the FRS and those designated or approved by the System. This actuarial valuation may be provided to parties other than the System only in its entirety and only with the permission of the System. GRS is not responsible for unauthorized use of this report.

An actuarial valuation of the system is performed annually as required by the Missouri State statutes. The actuarial valuation was performed to measure the funding status of the System and determine the contribution for the following year.

Actuarial valuation information for GASB Statements No. 67 and 68 reporting is provided in a separate report.

This actuarial valuation is based upon:

- a) Data Relative to the Members of the System Data as of October 1, 2023, for active members and persons receiving benefits, including frozen accrued benefits as of February 1, 2013, was provided by the System's staff. We have tested this data for reasonableness.
- **b)** Asset Values The System's asset values as of October 1, 2023, were provided by the System's auditor. An actuarial value of assets was used to develop the sponsor's funding requirements.
- c) Actuarial Method The actuarial cost method utilized by the System as required by Missouri State statutes is the Frozen Entry Age Actuarial Cost Method. The objective of this method is to recognize the cost of the System on an aggregate basis as a level percentage of compensation. Any frozen unfunded actuarial accrued liability resulting from changes in plan provisions, actuarial assumptions or methods is separately amortized. All actuarial gains and losses under this method are reflected in future normal costs.
- **d)** Actuarial Assumptions The actuarial assumptions were updated based on the experience review for the period October 1, 2018, through September 30, 2022, and are first effective with this actuarial valuation as of October 1, 2023.

The Pension Board Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis Page 2

e) Plan Provisions — The actuarial valuation is based on plan provisions in effect as of October 1, 2023, including the provisions of Ordinance 69245, Ordinance 69353, and Judge Dierker's subsequent ruling (Board Bill 109 or BB109).

The contribution rate in this report is determined using the actuarial assumptions and methods disclosed in Section C of this report. All actuarial assumptions used in this report are reasonable for the purposes of this valuation. The combined effect of the assumptions, excluding prescribed assumptions or methods set by law, is expected to have no significant bias (i.e. not significantly optimistic or pessimistic). This report includes risk metrics beginning on page 5, but does not include a more robust assessment of the risks if future experience deviates from the actuarial assumptions. Additional assessment of risks was outside the scope of this assignment.

The funding objective is to provide employer and employee contributions sufficient to provide the benefits of the System when due. The employer contributes the normal contribution rate (normal cost under Frozen Entry Age Actuarial Cost Method) plus the accrued liability rate (amortization of the frozen unfunded actuarial liability).

This valuation assumed the continuing ability of the plan sponsor to make the contributions necessary to fund this plan. A determination regarding whether or not the plan sponsor is actually able to do so is outside our scope of expertise and was not performed.

The actuarial valuation results set forth in this report are based on the data and actuarial techniques described above, and upon the provisions of the System as of the actuarial valuation date. Based on these items, we certify these results to be true and correct.

This report is based upon information, furnished to us by the System, concerning retirement and ancillary benefits, active members, deferred vested members, retirees and beneficiaries, and financial data. If your understanding of this information is different, please let us know. This information was checked for internal consistency, but it was not audited.

To the best of our knowledge, this actuarial statement is complete and accurate, fairly presents the actuarial position of the Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis as of October 1, 2023, and has been prepared in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles and practices, with the Actuarial Standards of Practice issued by the Actuarial Standards Board, and with applicable statutes.

This report was prepared using our proprietary valuation model and related software which, in our professional judgment, has the capability to provide results that are consistent with the purposes of the valuation, and has no material limitations or known weaknesses. We performed tests to ensure that the model reasonably represents that which is intended to be modeled. We are relying on the GRS actuaries and Internal Software, Training, and Processes Team who developed and maintain the model.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions; changes in economic or demographic assumptions; increases or



The Pension Board Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis Page 3

decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status); and changes in plan provisions, contribution amounts, or applicable law. Due to the limited scope of the actuary's assignment, the actuary did not perform an analysis of the potential range of such future measurements in this report.

The signing actuaries are independent of the plan sponsor.

This report should not be relied on for any purpose other than the purpose stated.

Alex Rivera and Jeffrey T. Tebeau are Members of the American Academy of Actuaries (MAAA) and meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion herein.

Respectfully yours,

Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company

alex Rivera

Alex Rivera, FSA, EA, MAAA, FCA Senior Consultant

bear.

Jeffrey T. Tebeau, FSA, EA, MAAA, FCA Senior Consultant



### **Purposes of the Actuarial Valuation**

At your request, we have performed the actuarial valuation of the Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis ("FRS") as of October 1, 2023.

The purposes of the actuarial valuation are as follows:

- To determine the funding status of the System as of the actuarial valuation date;
- To determine the current contribution level of the System required to fund the current benefit provisions; and
- To provide other data required by the System.

### Plan Provisions and Board Bill 109

The actuarial valuation is based on plan provisions in effect as of October 1, 2023, including the provisions of Board Bill 109.

First effective with the actuarial valuation as of October 1, 2013, the actuarial valuation reflects the changes attributable to Ordinance 69245, Ordinance 69353, and Judge Dierker's subsequent ruling (Board Bill 109 or BB109). Our understanding of the key changes to the FRS is as follows:

- FRS is frozen as of February 1, 2013. That is, benefits paid from FRS will be based on the member's service and salary earned as of February 1, 2013. Participants with benefit service in FRS are classified as "grandfathered" members.
- Firefighters hired after February 1, 2013, are not members of FRS.
- Vesting and eligibility service earned after February 1, 2013, in the newly established Firemen's Retirement Plan of St. Louis ("FRP") will count towards vesting and eligibility service in FRS.
- Ancillary benefits, for disability or death occurring after February 1, 2013, are assumed to be paid from the newly established FRP. FRS members who become disabled or die before retirement are eligible for a refund of contributions made to FRS.
- Employer contributions to the frozen FRS will continue to be calculated under the Frozen Initial Liability cost method.
- Member contributions after February 1, 2013, from "grandfathered" participants in FRS will be paid to the FRP.
- Grandfathered members with 20 or more years of service as of February 1, 2013, are eligible to retire with unreduced FRP benefits if retirement commences before age 55.
- Grandfathered members with less than 20 years of service as of February 1, 2013, are eligible to retire with actuarially reduced FRP benefits if retirement commences before age 55.

As a result of BB109, the following assumptions were made:

- Since benefits paid under FRS will no longer depend on future salary increases, we have eliminated the future salary increase assumption in the projection of pay and valuation of benefits. Costs will continue to be spread over the present value of future salary which includes future salary increases.
- It is assumed that grandfathered members with less than 20 years of service as of February 1, 2013, will not retire prior to age 55. The retirement rates were adjusted to reflect accelerated retirement when these members first become eligible at age 55.



• The proportion of ordinary and accidental disabilities was changed from 20 percent ordinary and 80 percent accidental to 60 percent ordinary and 40 percent accidental. Subsequently, the portion of ordinary and accidental disabilities was changed as part of the experience review for the period October 1, 2014, through September 30, 2018, and as part of the experience review for the period October 1, 2018, through September 30, 2022.

Finally, plan liabilities for FRS after BB109 are predominantly for retired members and their beneficiaries. That is, the proportion of retired liabilities (including DROP balances of retirees) to total plan liabilities is approximately 75 percent as of October 1, 2023. This implies a much shorter duration of liabilities. As a result of this relationship, it is recommended that the discount rate be reviewed annually as the duration decreases and the investment policy is modified.

Under the 2015 Settlement Agreement, accrued sick leave earned through February 1, 2013, and unused as of the member's retirement date can be converted to a pension benefit.

Plan provisions are described in Section C.

# **Actuarial Assumptions and Methods**

An experience study of the Firemen's Retirement System of St. Louis for the period October 1, 2018, to September 30, 2022, was performed. The primary purpose of the study was to compare the actual demographic and economic experience with the actuarial assumptions used in the actuarial valuations. The study was based on the information used to perform the annual actuarial valuations for the period October 1, 2018, to September 30, 2022.

Following is a summary of the key finding and recommendations:

- Maintain the assumed investment return assumption of 6.75 percent.
- Maintain the price inflation assumption of 2.50 percent.
- Maintain the general payroll growth assumption of 2.75 percent.
- Adjust the salary increase assumption to coincide with the FRP salary increase assumption.
- Continue to use the Pub 2010 Safety Healthy Retiree and Employee Mortality Tables. Change to the Pub-2010 Safety Contingent Survivor Mortality tables for survivors/beneficiaries. Update the rates used for adjustments for future mortality improvements from Scale MP-2019 to MP-2021.
- Adjust the normal retirement rates to better reflect observed experience. In general, overall decreases are recommended for normal retirement rates.
- Assume eligible members enter the DROP after earning at least 27 years of service.
- Adjust the timing of DROP distributions to better reflect observed experience.
- Maintain termination rates.
- Assume members use Sick Leave Balances earned as of February 1, 2013, at rate of 1.50 percent per year.
- Decrease disability rates and change the disability allocation assumption to coincide with the FRP disability assumptions.

All actuarial assumptions and methods are disclosed in Section C of this report.



# Introduction

## **Asset Information**

The market value of the assets of the fund, which are available for benefits, decreased from \$407.9 million at the end of FY 2022 to \$402.8 million at the end of FY 2023. The market value of assets reflects a transfer of \$166,792, from the FRS Future Benefit Fund to the FRS General Reserve Fund, as part of the 2015 Settlement Agreement. The actuarial value of assets decreased from \$445.3 million at the end of fiscal year 2022 to \$432.2 million at the end of fiscal year 2023.

The detailed determinations of asset values utilized in this actuarial valuation and asset changes in the last year are set forth in Section A.

### **Report Highlights**

The following table compares the key actuarial results from the October 1, 2023, actuarial valuation to the prior year's results.

The key difference between this year's actuarial valuation results and the prior year's actuarial valuation results is an increase in the City Contribution from \$3.55 million for plan year ending September 30, 2023, to \$4.44 million for plan year ending September 30, 2024, due to unfavorable investment experience that was partially offset by changes in actuarial assumptions related to the 2023 experience review.

Summary of Results	Oct	ober 1, 2022	Assumptions ober 1, 2023	New Assumptions October 1, 2023		
Total Contribution	\$	3,546,643	\$ 4,914,654	\$	4,436,672	
Present Value of Benefits		476,035,684	470,432,208		468,670,333	
Actuarial Value of Assets		445,312,686	432,154,293		432,154,293	
Market Value of Assets <sup>a</sup>		407,922,604	402,809,159		402,809,159	

<sup>a</sup> Excluding Future Benefit Fund

The present value of benefits decreased by \$7.37 million from \$476.04 million as of October 1, 2022, to \$468.67 million as of October 1, 2023. The key reasons for the decrease include:

- \$3.09 million reduction in expected liability, for the closed and frozen FRS plan, due to the payment of benefits and adjustments for interest.
- \$0.06 million net gain due to terminations, deaths, or disabilities during the year for members who were active in the last actuarial valuation. Under current provisions, FRP pays death and disability benefits to FRS members who accrue or have accrued benefits under FRP, resulting in an actuarial gain to FRS.
- \$2.46 million gain due to other demographic experience and data adjustments.
- \$1.76 million decrease in the present value of benefits due to changes in actuarial assumptions.

During the plan year, the market value of assets earned 6.4 percent, and decreased from \$407.9 million at October 1, 2023, to \$402.8 million at October 1, 2023. The actuarial value of assets earned 4.0 percent



# Introduction

during the year and decreased from \$445.3 million at October 1, 2022, to \$432.2 million at October 1, 2023. The actuarial value of assets is based on a three-year smoothing of investment gains and losses. There were investment gains in 2021 that were offset by the investment losses in 2022 and 2023. The actuarial valuation is based on a return assumption of 6.75 percent; consequently, during plan year end 2023, the plan experienced an investment loss.

The City's contribution for plan year 2024 is based on a normal cost contribution plus a fixed amortization of \$1.16 million per year for the initial actuarial liability due to the 2019 and 2023 change in assumptions. A normal cost contribution is generated if the present value of benefits, less the actuarial value of assets, less the remaining balance of the initial actuarial liability is greater than zero. The City's expected normal cost contribution for 2024, before recognizing any plan year 2023 experience, was \$3.78 million. After recognizing the experience factors discussed in the preceding two paragraphs, such as investment losses and changes in actuarial assumptions, the City's normal cost contribution is \$3.28 million. Based on the frozen entry age cost method, the existing initial actuarial liability bases are set to zero if the present value of benefits is less than the actuarial value of assets. The present value of benefits is greater than the actuarial value of assets; therefore, the City's contribution for plan year 2024 is \$4.44 million.

The actuarial valuation results are presented in Section A of the report.

# **Membership Characteristics**

The following table shows the changes in the population of the fund. Because FRS is closed to new members, the active population has continued to decrease.

Population	October 1, 2022	October 1, 2023
Retired Members	348	357
Disabled Members	229	218
Widows and Children	244	244
Total Inactive Members	821	819
Actives - Non-DROP	333	313
Actives - DROP <sup>a</sup>	102	94
Total Active and DROP Members	435	407

<sup>a</sup> As of October 1, 2023, there are 300 members with DROP account balances, of which 94 are active members participating in the DROP.

More detailed breakouts of the membership can be found in Section B.

### **GASB Disclosure**

Actuarial valuation information for GASB Statements No. 67 and 68 reporting is provided in a separate report.



4

# Risk Associated with Measuring the Present Value of Future Benefits and Contributions

The determination of the present value of future benefits and the statutory contribution requires the use of actuarial assumptions regarding future economic and demographic experience. Risk measures, as illustrated in this report, are intended to aid in the understanding of the effects of future experience differing from the actuarial assumptions used in the course of the actuarial valuation. Risk measures may also help with illustrating the potential volatility in the present value of future benefits and the total required employer contribution that result from the differences between actual experience and the actuarial assumptions.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions; changes in economic or demographic assumptions due to changing conditions; increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period, or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the fund's funded status); and changes in plan provisions or applicable law. The scope of an actuarial valuation does not include an analysis of the potential range of such future measurements.

Examples of risk that may reasonably be anticipated to significantly affect the fund's future financial condition include:

- 1. Investment Risk actual investment returns may differ from the expected returns;
- 2. Asset/Liability Mismatch changes in asset values may not match changes in liabilities, thereby altering the gap between the present value of future benefits and assets and consequently altering the funded status and contribution requirements;
- Contribution Risk actual contributions may differ from expected future contributions. For example, actual contributions may not be made in accordance with the fund's funding policy or material changes may occur in the anticipated number of covered employees, covered payroll, or other relevant contribution base;
- 4. Salary and Payroll Risk actual salaries and total payroll may differ from expected, resulting in actual future present value of future benefits and contributions differing from expected;
- 5. **Longevity Risk** members may live longer or shorter than expected and receive pensions for a period of time other than assumed; and
- 6. **Other Demographic Risks** members may terminate, retire, or become disabled at times or with benefits other than assumed, resulting in actual future present value of future benefits and contributions differing from expected.

The effects of certain trends in experience can generally be anticipated. For example, if the investment return since the most recent actuarial valuation is less (or more) than the assumed rate, the cost of the plan can be expected to increase (or decrease). Likewise, if longevity is improving (or worsening), increases (or decreases) in cost can be anticipated.

The statutory contribution for fiscal year 2024 shown on page A-1 should be considered as the minimum contribution that complies with the funding policy governed by statute. Users of this report should be aware that contributions made at the statutorily determined amount do not necessarily guarantee benefit security.



# **Plan Maturity Measures**

Risks facing a pension plan evolve over time. A young plan with virtually no investments and paying few benefits may experience little investment risk. An older plan with a large number of members in pay status and a significant trust may be much more exposed to investment risk. Generally accepted plan maturity measures include the following:

Valuation Year	Ratio of the Market Value of Assets to Covered Payroll	Ratio of Present Value of Future Benefits to Covered Payroll	Ratio of Unfunded Present Value of Future Benefits to Covered Payroll	Funded Ratio Market Value Basis	Ratio of Actives to Retirees and Beneficiaries
2017	13.69	13.50	-0.19	101.37%	0.57
2018	13.83	13.65	-0.18	101.29%	0.58
2019	12.94	13.98	1.04	92.55%	0.55
2020	12.64	14.03	1.38	90.13%	0.56
2021	15.04	14.66	-0.38	102.59%	0.54
2022	12.92	15.07	2.16	85.69%	0.53
2023	13.32	15.50	2.18	85.95%	0.50

Valuation Year	Ratio of Retiree Present Value of Future Benefits to Total Present Value of Future Benefits	Approximate Duration of Present Value of Future Benefits	Ratio of Net Cash Flow to Market Value of Assets	Ratio of Benefits and Expenses to Contributions
2017	0.68	8.65	-6.07%	10.23
2018	0.67	8.42	-6.27%	12.47
2019	0.68	8.78	-7.71%	N/A
2020	0.68	8.56	-7.55%	27.28
2021	0.68	8.25	-6.03%	10.09
2022	0.68	8.04	-7.67%	15.14
2023	0.69	7.81	-7.54%	9.94

# Ratio of Market Value of Assets to Payroll

For funding policies that are based on actuarially determined contributions, which are expressed as a percentage of payroll, the ratio of market value of assets to payroll may provide an indicator of the sensitivity in contribution rates due to recent investment experience. However, this sensitivity indicator generally depends on the relative level of liabilities and the funded ratio of the plan.

For example, better funded plans will have lower contribution rates when compared to worst funded plans. However, investment loss will generally have a greater impact on the contribution rates of



better funded plans when compared to worst funded plans.

Consequently, as assets increase and the funding ratio improves, investment experience will generally have a greater marginal impact on contribution rates, even though contribution rates may be decreasing.

# **Ratio of Present Value of Future Benefits to Payroll**

The relationship between present value of future benefits and payroll is a useful indicator of the potential volatility of contributions for a fully funded plan. A funding policy that targets a funded ratio of 100 percent is expected to result in the ratio of assets to payroll and the ratio of present value of future benefits to payroll converging over time.

The ratio of present value of future benefits to payroll may also be used as a measure of sensitivity of the present value of future benefits itself. For example, if the present value of future benefits is 14 times the payroll, a change in present value of future benefits 2 percent other than assumed would equal 28 percent of payroll. A higher (lower) or increasing (decreasing) level of this maturity measure generally indicates a higher (lower) or increasing (decreasing) volatility in present value of future benefits (and also plan sponsor contributions) as a percentage of payroll.

As more active members terminate from FRS active status, we expect the ratio of present value of future benefits to payroll to increase. A closed plan comprised primarily of retired members will generally have a high ratio of present value of future benefits to payroll.

# **Ratio of Unfunded Present Value of Future Benefits to Payroll**

Plans with high unfunded present value of future benefits relative to payroll could result in unsustainable contribution rates, even though the plan is open. This may indicate the need to express contributions in terms of a dollar amount instead of as a percentage of payroll. It may also indicate the need to strengthen the funding policy, for example, by amortizing unfunded present value of future benefits on a level dollar instead of a level percentage of pay basis or by reducing the amortization period. The ratio of unfunded present value of future benefits to payroll decreased from -0.19 in 2017 to -0.38 in 2021 which indicates progress towards financing the unfunded present value of future benefits; however, due to unfavorable asset performance in 2022 and 2023, the ratio of unfunded present value of future benefits to payroll increased from -0.38 to 2.16 in 2022, and 2.18 in 2023.

A decrease in the ratio of unfunded present value of future benefits to payroll is an indicator that the System is making some progress towards funding the program; however, it could still produce an increasing unfunded present value of future benefits.



# **Funded Ratio**

The ratio of present value of future benefits to market value of assets provides another metric of progress towards funding. The System experienced a positive trend in the funded ratio from 2017 to 2021, but the funded ratio has decreased from 102.59 percent in 2021 to 85.95 percent in 2023. The decrease in the funded ratio was mainly due to unfavorable investment returns.

# **Ratio of Actives to Retirees and Beneficiaries**

A young plan with many active members and few retirees will have a high ratio of actives to retirees. A mature open plan may have close to the same number of actives to retirees resulting in a ratio near 1.0. A super-mature or closed plan may have significantly more retirees than actives resulting in a ratio below 1.0.

The System's ratio of active to retired members is trending downward and has decreased from 0.57 in 2017 to 0.50 in 2023. The ratio is expected to decrease in future years because FRS is frozen and future firefighters hired are not members of FRS.

# Ratio of Retiree Present Value of Future Benefits to Total Present Value of Future Benefits

The ratio of retiree present value of future benefits to total present value of future benefits also provides a measure of the maturity of the plan relative to the level of plan benefits that have been earned to date. This ratio has increased from 0.68 for 2017 to 0.69 for 2023. An increasing ratio could indicate a maturing plan. Some of the reasons for the trend remaining level is because of changes in assumptions and the ratio of retired to active members.

As the program matures, it is important to consider the matching of assets to liabilities to ensure intergenerational equity. For example, retiree liabilities that have not been pre-funded during the working lifetime of the retired member could produce intergenerational inequities.

# **Duration of Present Value of Future Benefits**

The duration of the present value of future benefits may be used to approximate the sensitivity of a one percentage point change in the assumed discount rate. For example, a duration of 10 indicates that the present value of future benefits could increase by approximately 10 percent if the assumed discount rate was lowered by one percentage point. The duration for active member liabilities is generally higher when compared to the duration for retired members. Consequently, a lower duration generally indicates a greater proportion of retired member liability. Changes to the discount rate assumption could also cause the duration factor to change. For the System, the duration factors have decreased from 8.65 in 2017 to 7.81 in 2023, which suggests a maturing group. Other factors such as emerging experience or changes in assumptions could also impact the year-to-year change in duration.



# **Ratio of Net Cash Flow to Market Value of Assets**

A positive net cash flow means contributions exceed benefits and expenses. A negative cash flow means existing funds are being used to make payments. A certain amount of negative net cash flow is generally expected to occur when benefits are prefunded through a qualified trust. Large negative net cash flows as a percent of assets may indicate a super-mature plan or a need for additional contributions.

# **Additional Risk Assessment**

Additional risk assessment is outside the scope of the annual actuarial valuation. Additional assessment may include scenario tests, sensitivity tests, stochastic modeling, stress tests, and a comparison of the present value of accrued benefits at low-risk discount rates with the present value of future benefits.



#### Introduction

In December 2021, the Actuarial Standards Board (ASB) adopted a revision to Actuarial Standard of Practice (ASOP) No. 4, Measuring Pension Obligations and Determining Pension Plan Costs or Contributions. The revised ASOP No. 4 requires the calculation and disclosure of a liability referred to by the ASOP as the "Low-Default-Risk Obligation Measure" (LDROM).

### What is the LDROM?

The LDROM is a particular measure of the benefits earned (or costs accrued if appropriate under the actuarial cost method used for this purpose) as of the measurement date.

### How is the LDROM Calculated?

The LDROM is calculated using an immediate gain actuarial cost method, one in which gains and losses become part of the unfunded actuarial accrued liabilities. Examples would be Entry Age Normal Cost, Projected Unit Credit, and Traditional Unit Credit. It is based upon a discount rate or discount rates derived from low-default-risk fixed income securities whose cash flows are reasonably consistent with the pattern of benefits expected to be paid in the future.

#### What Does the LDROM Tell Me?

The LDROM gives an approximate measure of the cost as of the measurement date of securing benefits by constructing a hypothetical Low Default Risk Bond portfolio whose cash flows match the pattern of benefits expected to be paid in the future. The LDROM is very dependent upon market interest rates at the time of the LDROM measurement. The lower the market interest rates, the higher the LDROM, and vice versa.

### Is the LDROM the "Right" Liability that Should Be Reported?

No single number, including the LDROM, can provide all of the information necessary to understand the financial condition of a pension plan. The rationale that the ASB cited for the calculation and disclosure of the LDROM was included in the Transmittal Memorandum of ASOP No. 4 and is presented below (emphasis added):

"The ASB believes that the calculation and disclosure of this measure provides appropriate, useful information for the intended user regarding the funded status of a pension plan. The calculation and disclosure of this additional measure is not intended to suggest that this is the "right" liability measure for a pension plan. However, the ASB does believe that this additional disclosure provides a more complete assessment of a plan's funded status and provides additional information regarding the security of benefits that members have earned as of the measurement date."

### **Comparing the Accrued Liabilities and the LDROM**

The LDROM results presented in this report are based on the Traditional Unit Credit (TUC) actuarial cost method and discount rates based upon the September 2023 (end of month) FTSE Pension Discount Curve (PDC). The PDC is calculated based on a universe of AA-rated corporate bonds from the FTSE US Broad Investment-Grade Bond Index (USBIG<sup>®</sup>) of varying maturities and the yields of the Treasury model curve.



Representative 1-, 5-, 10-, 20-and 30-year annual spot rates as of September 30, 2023, are 5.86%, 5.20%, 5.43%, 5.94%, and 5.57%, respectively.

The statutory funding actuarial accrued liability is based on the Frozen Entry Age actuarial cost method and discount rate (the expected long-term rate of return on assets) of 6.75%.

Presented below is a comparison of the statutory funding actuarial accrued liability and the LDROM as of September 30, 2023, for FRS:

Funding Valuation Present Value of All Future Benefits	\$ 468,670,333
LDROM Present Value of All Future Benefits	 519,878,104
Difference	\$ (51,207,771)

The difference between the statutory funding actuarial accrued liability and the LDROM illustrates the potential present value of future contribution savings due to investing in a well-diversified portfolio, consistent with the long-term investment return assumption, instead of a hypothetical low-default-risk bond portfolio.

Since plan assets are actually invested in a well-diversified portfolio, and not a low-default-risk fixed bond portfolio, LDROM does not provide relevant information on the funded status or statutory contribution requirements. Benefit security for members of the plan relies on a combination of the current assets in the plan, the future investment returns generated on those assets, and the promise of future contributions from the plan sponsor.

The LDROM liability contained in this report was provided solely to comply with the requirements of ASOP 4 section 3.11 and should not be used for any other purpose. This measure is not appropriate for assessing the need for or amount of future contributions. This measure is not appropriate for assessing the sufficiency of plan assets to cover the estimated cost of settling the plan's benefit obligation.



**SECTION A** 

**ACTUARIAL VALUATION RESULTS AND ASSET INFORMATION** 

#### Determination of City Contributions - Frozen Initial Liability

	00	October 1, 2022		Old Assumptions October 1, 2023		New Assumptions Stober 1, 2023
Present Value of All Future Benefits						
Retirees and Beneficiaries	\$	325,138,765	\$	322,862,719	\$	322,625,042
Active Firemen		78,556,620		75,382,863		74,232,608
DROP Firemen		72,129,643		71,931,201		71,557,258
System Employees Benefit Fund		210,656		255,425		255,425
Total	\$	476,035,684	\$	470,432,208	\$	468,670,333
Assets						
Actuarial Asset Value (3-year smoothing) Present Value of Future Employee Contributions	\$	445,312,686	\$	432,154,293	\$	432,154,293
Total	\$	445,312,686	\$	432,154,293	\$	432,154,293
Unfunded Accrued Liability <sup>a</sup>	\$	15,923,896	\$	15,701,521	\$	13,939,646
Present Value of Future Normal Costs	\$	14,799,102	\$	22,576,394	\$	22,576,394
Present Value of Future Salary <sup>b</sup>	\$	207,795,954	\$	188,706,251	\$	208,241,157
Normal Contribution Percent		7.122%		11.964%		10.841%
Total Salary <sup>b</sup>	\$	31,583,893	\$	30,235,832	\$	30,235,832
Annual City Contributions for Plan Year Ending	Sept	tember 30, 2023	Sept	tember 30, 2024	Sept	tember 30, 2024
Normal Contribution	\$	2,249,405	\$	3,617,415	\$	3,277,867
Accrued Liability Amortization Payment		1,297,238		1,297,239		1,158,805
Grand Total	\$	3,546,643	\$	4,914,654	\$	4,436,672
Normal Contribution as a % of Total Salary		7.122%		11.964%		10.841%
Total Contribution as a % of Total Salary		11.229%		16.254%		14.674%

<sup>a</sup> Change in unfunded accrued liability due to change in assumptions is amortized over a 30-year period on a level-dollar basis.

<sup>b</sup> Includes salary of all active members.



#### Present Value of Future Benefits

		Old Assumptions	New Assumptions
Retirees	October 1, 2022	October 1, 2023	October 1, 2023
1960 Plan	\$ 147,826,266	\$ 152,462,902	\$ 151,983,528
Prospective Widows and Children of Retired Firemen	9,945,865	9,463,897	9,658,815
Ordinary Disability			
1960 Plan	4,493,202	3,818,205	3,812,132
Prospective Widows and Children of Retired Firemen	574,477	526,528	528,834
Accidental Disability			
1960 Plan	124,940,040	118,445,063	118,161,379
Prospective Widows and Children of Retired Firemen	7,608,869	7,609,215	7,679,284
Widows			
1960 Plan	29,408,422	30,083,599	30,355,485
Children			
1960 Plan	341,624	453,310	445,585
Total Inactives	\$ 325,138,765	\$ 322,862,719	\$ 322,625,042
Active Firemen			
Service Retirement	\$ 77,415,310	\$ 74,395,687	\$ 73,172,468
Ordinary Disability Retirement <sup>a</sup>	102,975	89,219	52,708
Accidental Disability Retirement <sup>a</sup>	411,861	356,870	298,637
Withdrawal Benefit	52,384	35,991	34,135
Ordinary Death <sup>a</sup>	258,785	223,288	308,070
Accidental Death <sup>a</sup>	258,785	223,288	308,070
Terminated - Pending Refund	56,520	58,520	58,520
Total Actives	\$ 78,556,620	\$ 75,382,863	\$ 74,232,608
DROP Firemen <sup>b</sup>			
Retiree Account Balances	\$ 25,309,646	\$ 28,813,500	\$ 28,813,500
Active Firemen <sup>c</sup>	46,819,997	43,117,701	42,743,758
Total DROPS	\$ 72,129,643	\$ 71,931,201	\$ 71,557,258
System Employees Benefit Fund	\$ 210,656	\$ 255,425	\$ 255,425
Total Present Value Future Benefits	\$ 476,035,684	\$ 470,432,208	\$ 468,670,333

<sup>a</sup> FRS members are eligible for a refund of contributions made to FRS upon pre-retirement death or disability.

<sup>b</sup> As of October 1, 2023, there are 300 members with DROP account balances, of which 94 are active members participating in the DROP.

<sup>c</sup> Includes active DROP balances, Refund of Member Contributions, and Future Account Additions and Benefits.



#### **Actuarial Value of Assets**

(a) Market	Value of Assets as of 9/30/22 <sup>a</sup>						\$ 40	7,922,604
(b) Actual	Income and Disbursements in Prior	r Ye	ar Weighted for T	ïming				
	ltem		Amount	Weight for Timing		Weighted Amount		
i) Me	mber Contributions	\$	-	50.0%	\$	-		
ii) Cit	y Contributions & Misc.		3,546,643	50.0%		1,773,322		
iii) Ber	nefit Payments		(32,120,261)	50.0%		(16,060,131)		
iv) Ref	unds		(1,968,556)	50.0%		(984,278)		
v) Tra	nsfer Due to Sick Leave Settlement		166,792	50.0%		83,396		
vi) Tot	al	\$	(30,375,382)		\$	(15,187,691)		
(c) Market	Value of Assets Adj. for Actual Inco	ome	and Disburseme	nts [(a) + (b)(v	i))]		\$ 39	2,734,913
. ,	ed Rate of Return on Plan Assets for				• //1		<b>+</b> 001	6.750
. ,	ed Return over 12-Month Period						2	6,509,607
	ed Market Value of Assets 10/1/23							4,056,829
<ul><li>(a) Market</li><li>(b) Income</li><li>(c) Market</li></ul>	Irn on Market Value of Assets for Po Value of Assets as of 9/30/22 <sup>a</sup> (less investment income and expen Value of Assets as of 10/1/23 <sup>a</sup> Return, Net of Expenses [(c) - (b) - (a	nse		′ear			(30 402	7,922,604 0,375,382 2,809,159 5,261,937
) Investment	: Gain/(Loss) for Prior Period [2(d) -	1(e	2)]				\$ (:	1,247,670
	alue of Assets as of 10/1/23	-					•	
	Value of Assets as of 10/1/23 <sup>a</sup>						\$ 40'	2,809,159
• •	d Investment Gains and (Losses) fo	r La	ist 3 Years				φ <del>τ</del> 02	_,,
	Plan Year			Weight for		Deferred		
i)	2021	Ś	Gain/(Loss) 58,909,879	Timing 0.00%	\$	Amount		
ii)	2022	Ļ	(85,540,062)	33.33%	ب	(28,513,354)		
,								
iii)	2023		(1,247,670)	66.67%		(831,780)		

(c) Actuarial Value of Assets [(a) - (b) (iv)]

\$ 432,154,293

The calculated value is determined by adjusting the market value of assets to reflect the investment gains and losses (the difference between the actual investment return and the expected investment return) during each of the last 3 years at the rate of 33.33% per year.

<sup>a</sup> Excluding Future Benefit Fund of \$3,729,496 as of September 30, 2022, and \$3,802,648 as of September 30, 2023.



# **Summary of Actuarial Valuation Results**

Date	Original	Outstanding	 Payment	Outstanding
Established	Period	Period 10/1/23	End of Year	Balance 10/1/23
10/1/2019 <sup>a</sup>	30	26 Years, 0 Months	1,297,239	\$ 15,701,521
10/1/2023 <sup>b</sup>	30	30 Years, 0 Months	(138,434)	\$ (1,761,875)
Total			\$ 1,158,805	\$ 13,939,646

#### Amortization Schedule of Unfunded Accrued Liability

<sup>a</sup> As of October 1, 2019, the unfunded accrued liability increased by \$16,510,154 due to change in actuarial assumptions. The initial unfunded accrued liability is amortized over a 30-year period on a level-dollar basis using an interest rate of 6.75 percent.

<sup>b</sup> As of October 1, 2023, the unfunded accrued liability decreased by \$1,761,875 due to change in actuarial assumptions. The initial unfunded accrued liability is amortized over a 30-year period on a level-dollar basis using an interest rate of 6.75 percent.



The actuarial valuation balance sheet shown below demonstrates the sources of income required to fund the current present value of future benefits as of the actuarial valuation date.

#### **Actuarial Valuation Balance Sheet**

#### **Sources of Funds**

Actuarial Asset Value	\$ 432,154,293	
Present Value of Future Employee Contributions		\$-
Present Value of City's Future Contributions		
Normal Cost	\$ 22,576,394	
Accrued Liability	13,939,646	
Total		\$ 36,516,040
Grand Total		\$ 468,670,333



# Change in Market Value of Assets<sup>a,b</sup>

#### Receipts

Paid by City			
Allocated to General Reserve Fund		\$	3,546,643
Members' Contribution			
To Members' Savings Fund		\$	-
Income Received on Investments			
Allocated to Member's Savings Fund	\$ 5,179,621		
Allocated to Benefit Reserve Fund	19,885,126		
Allocated to General Reserve Fund	197,190		
Allocated to Future Benefit Fund	239,944		
Allocated to Expense Fund	1,185,585	\$	26,687,466
	<i>````</i>		, ,
Total Receipts		\$	30,234,109
•			, ,
Disbursemer	nts		
Payment to Retired Members and Dependents:			
, From Benefit Reserve Fund			
To Retirees, Beneficiaries, and Dependents		\$	(32,120,261)
		T	(//
From Future Benefit Fund			
To Retirees, Beneficiaries, and Dependents		\$	-
From Members Savings Fund		~	
Withdrawals, Deaths, and Retirements		\$	(1,968,556)
Operating Expenses		\$	(1,185,585)
		-	•••••
Total Disbursements		\$	(35,274,402)
Net Operating Income		\$	(5,040,293)
Fund Balance October 1, 2022 <sup>a</sup>		\$	411,652,100
Fund Balance October 1, 2023 <sup>a</sup>		\$	406,611,807

<sup>a</sup> Includes Future Benefit Fund Assets of \$3,729,496 as of October 1, 2023, and \$3,802,648 as of October 1, 2024. <sup>b</sup> Based on draft Statement of Changes in Fiduciary Net Position provided by FRS auditor Sikich.



# **Description of Funds**

For administrative purposes, the assets of the System are accounted for as four separate funds, as described below. The first three funds were established by Ordinance 49623. The other fund, the Future Benefit Fund, was established by Ordinance 61414. Only the assets of the first three funds are considered when determining the actuarial funding requirements.

**Member's Savings Fund:** All contributions by members are credited to this Fund. Interest at a rate determined by the Board is credited annually on the minimum balance in each member's account during the preceding year. Withdrawal of refunds of member's accumulated contribution is charged to this Fund. Upon retirement or death of an active member after October 2, 1983, the member's own contributions are refunded to the member, while the balance of the member's accumulated contribution fund is transferred to the Benefit Reserve Fund.

**Benefit Reserve Fund:** Upon retirement or death, this fund is credited with the remaining balance of the member's accumulated contribution fund after the member's own contributions have been refunded from the Member's Savings Fund. It is also credited with an additional amount from the General Reserve Fund which, when added to the Benefit Reserve Fund, will be adequate to provide the present value of all benefits payable to all members and beneficiaries currently receiving benefits. All annuities granted are payable from this Fund.

**General Reserve Fund:** Contributions made by the City are credited to this Fund, and the reserves for benefits not provided by member's contributions are accumulated in this fund.

**Future Benefit Fund**: The Future Benefit Fund is excluded from the assets used to determine the contribution requirement for the upcoming year. Through the SHARE program, three-fourths of the return on the fund is used to provide ad hoc increases for members not eligible for other benefit increases. One-half of the return was used for the SHARE program prior to September 1, 2016.

Under the 2015 Settlement Agreement, starting in plan year October 1, 2015, \$166,792 will be transferred each year from the Future Benefit Fund to the General Reserve Fund for the next 15-year period. As of the valuation date, seven years remain.



#### Change in Fund Balances

	<u>Total</u>	Members <u>Savings Fund</u>	Benefit <u>Reserve Fund</u>	General <u>Reserve Fund</u>	Future <u>Benefit Fund</u>
Market Value, September 30, 2022	\$ 411,652,100	\$ 81,492,199	\$ 325,138,765	\$ 1,291,640	\$ 3,729,496
Additions					
City Appropriations	3,546,643	-	-	3,546,643	-
Interest and Dividends Received <sup>1</sup>	25,501,881	5,179,621	19,885,126	197,190	239,944
Transfer Due to Surplus/Deficit		(6,356,985)	9,721,412	(3,364,427)	
Total Additions	29,048,524	(1,177,364)	29,606,538	379,406	239,944
Deductions					
Benefit Payments	(32,120,261)	-	(32,120,261)	-	-
Refunds w/o Interest and					
Withdrawals w/ Interest	(1,968,556)	(1,968,556)	-	-	-
Transfer in accordance with Sick Leave Settlement		-	-	166,792	(166,792)
Total Deductions	(34,088,817)	(1,968,556)	(32,120,261)	166,792	(166,792)
Market Value, September 30, 2023	\$ 406,611,807	\$ 78,346,279	\$ 322,625,042	\$ 1,837,838	\$ 3,802,648

<sup>1</sup>Net of administrative expenses



**SECTION B** 

DATA REFLECTING PLAN MEMBERSHIP

#### Summary of Membership as of October 1, 2023

#### **Retirees and Dependents**

	<u>Number</u>	Monthly Pensio	
<b>Retirees</b> 1960 Plan	357	\$	1,261,660
<b>Ordinary Disability</b> 1960 Plan	16		28,153
Accidental Disability 1960 Plan	202		925,350
Widows 1960 Plan	232		313,449
<b>Children</b> 1960 Plan	12		7,004
Total	819	\$	2,535,616

#### Active and DROP

	Number	Member's Annual Compensation Contributio			on
					<u></u>
Actives - Non-DROP	313	Ş	22,955,249	\$	0
Actives - DROP	94		7,280,583		0
Total	407	\$	30,235,832	\$	0



Active Non-DROP Members as of October 1, 2023 By Attained Age and Years of Service

Attained				Years of Se	ervice to Valu	ation Date				
Age	0-4	5-9	10-14	15-19	20-24	25-29	30-34	35 & Up		Totals
20-24									\$	
25-29									Ş	-
									\$	-
30-34									\$	-
35-39			8	2					Ŷ	10
		\$	533,555	\$ 164,125					\$	697,680
40-44			5	31						36
		\$	333,472	\$2,229,706					\$	2,563,178
45-49			3	34	20	2				59
		\$	200,083	\$2,361,261	\$1,503,652	\$ 153,172			\$	4,218,169
50-54			1	23	38	21	2			85
		\$	68,214	\$1,642,795	\$2,737,034	\$1,649,941	\$ 154,835		\$	6,252,820
55-59				14	16	27	19	3		79
				\$ 940,943	\$1,125,254	\$1,963,195	\$1,478,413	\$ 268,582	\$	5,776,387
60-64				6		9	13	7		35
				\$ 405,495		\$ 638,486	\$ 997,558	\$ 576,727	\$	2,618,267
65-69				2		2		4		8
				\$ 134,912		\$ 153,670		\$ 436,884	\$	725,466
70+								1		1
_								\$ 103,282	\$	103,282
tals: Count	0	0	17	112	74	61	34	15		313
Payroll <sup>1</sup>		\$	1,135,325	\$7,879,237	\$ 5,365,940	\$4,558,465	\$ 2,630,807	\$1,385,475	\$	22,955,249

<sup>1</sup>*Payroll provided only contained six months of pay. For valuation purposes, we approximated the payroll by multiplying the amount provided by two.* 



	Attained	Years of Service to Valuation Date							
	Age		20-24		25-29		30 & Up		Totals
	40-44								
								\$	-
	45-49		1						1
		\$	83,774	\$	-	\$	-	\$	83,774
	50-54		2				2		4
		\$	137,028	\$	-	\$	170,193	\$	307,221
	55-59		12		5		31		48
		\$	812,913	\$	374,921	\$	2,583,924	\$	3,771,758
	60-64		9		1		27		37
		\$	647,139	\$	84,447	\$	2,081,573	\$	2,813,158
	65-69		2		1		1		4
		\$	137,219	\$	69,268	\$	98,184	\$	304,671
Totals:	Count		26		7		61		94
	Payroll <sup>1</sup>	\$	1,818,073		528,635		4,933,874	\$	7,280,582

#### Active DROP Members as of October 1, 2023 By Attained Age and Years of Service

<sup>1</sup>Payroll provided only contained six months of pay. For valuation purposes, we approximated the payroll by multiplying the amount provided by two.



Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	Monthly <u>Allowance</u>	Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	Monthly <u>Allowance</u>
46	1	\$ 1,221.43	74	9	\$ 46,532.72
50	2	2,293.94	75	5	14,376.45
52	3	5,705.83	76	12	52,651.02
53	1	1,338.99	77	7	34,571.16
55	3	5,677.75	78	7	23,345.73
56	6	14,547.45	79	1	4,069.75
57	10	25,717.02	80	6	26,271.16
58	10	24,621.94	81	8	27,360.51
59	15	39,958.71	82	7	23,077.23
60	11	29,829.39	83	7	24,162.50
61	19	49,046.46	84	10	30,600.88
62	15	46,934.29	85	7	22,331.54
63	15	54,283.83	86	6	16,388.17
64	15	65,062.50	87	4	11,926.57
65	20	75,111.25	88	3	11,236.47
66	13	60,997.09	89	3	7,533.35
67	16	62,953.11	90	4	12,077.23
68	13	53,010.19	91	4	10,973.18
69	10	40,422.45	92	2	3,759.17
70	10	48,600.56	93	2	4,640.46
71	8	39,894.58	95	2	4,291.44
72	10	47,095.88	103	1	2,689.97
73	14	52,468.82			 
			Total	357	\$ 1,261,660.12
			Average Monthly Allowance		\$ 3,534.06
			Average Age		70.0

#### Service Retirees - 1960 Plan



Ordinary	Disability	<b>Retirees</b> -	1960 Plan
----------	------------	-------------------	-----------

Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	Monthly <u>Allowance</u>		
49	2	\$	3,753.57	
54	1		2,125.33	
55	3		4,335.09	
56	1		1,371.02	
62	1		1,500.71	
68	1		1,180.04	
69	1		1,523.92	
71	1		1,709.40	
72	1		1,409.70	
75	2		4,590.16	
80	1		2,848.56	
81	1		1,805.00	
Total	16	\$	28,152.50	
Average Monthly				
Allowance		\$	1,759.53	
Average Age			64.1	



Age		Age			Monthly	
<u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	<u>Allowance</u>	<u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	<u> </u>	Allowance
41	1	\$ 4,517.68	70	4	\$	18,749.75
46	1	4,900.32	71	2		9,874.70
47	1	4,900.32	72	5		26,723.63
48	1	4,517.68	73	8		41,229.96
49	1	4,517.68	74	7		30,911.04
51	1	4,317.19	75	3		17,928.45
52	2	10,318.82	76	6		26,303.91
53	3	14,017.81	77	2		11,172.78
54	2	9,237.34	78	2		10,220.38
55	2	8,891.16	79	2		8,898.97
56	4	18,204.98	80	9		36,794.20
57	4	18,797.92	81	2		8,568.81
58	6	28,173.78	82	2		8,522.41
59	9	42,952.17	83	6		22,448.80
60	9	43,577.20	84	4		10,818.70
61	12	55,642.31	85	4		16,321.96
62	12	59,462.66	86	6		17,239.01
63	8	41,946.24	87	3		9,464.10
64	1	4,615.88	88	6		16,682.36
65	11	59,727.13	89	3		7,419.19
66	8	42,287.51	91	2		9,229.00
67	1	4,480.86	92	1		3,944.89
68	2	9,239.73	93	1		3,182.46
69	10	53,456.62				

#### Accidental Disability Retirees - 1960 Plan

Total	202	\$ 925,350.45
Average Monthly		
Allowance		\$ 4,580.94
Average Age		69.3



Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	Monthly <u>llowance</u>	Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	Monthly <u>Allowance</u>
35	1	\$ 1,953.57	77	11	\$ 16,713.65
55	2	4,642.36	78	6	8,138.34
56	1	1,429.49	79	11	14,864.91
57	1	1,868.76	80	7	9,230.57
58	4	6,922.22	81	20	26,260.27
59	4	7,665.76	82	11	13,037.08
60	3	6,829.21	83	17	19,670.24
61	2	3,315.18	84	12	11,780.74
62	2	3,718.74	85	12	16,690.99
63	1	1,590.88	86	5	7,840.46
64	2	2,109.32	87	7	7,791.98
65	6	9,347.12	88	5	6,884.80
66	6	13,614.55	89	4	4,647.16
67	5	8,010.80	90	5	4,381.18
68	3	4,623.08	91	7	6,304.04
69	2	2,749.03	92	6	5,451.34
70	5	8,563.94	93	3	1,961.74
71	2	3,407.32	94	1	556.30
72	6	9,320.96	95	3	3,984.60
73	4	5,255.63	96	3	2,145.87
74	6	7,330.89	97	1	953.74
75	1	2,221.95	101	1	330.98
76	4	6,845.72	105	1	 491.58
			Total Average Monthly	232	\$ 313,449.04
			Allowance		\$ 1,351.07

#### Widows - 1960 Plan

Average Age



78.8

Age <u>9/30/2023</u>	<u>Number</u>	/lonthly lowance
10	1	\$ 515.58
16	2	1,191.52
19	1	475.12
21	1	318.18
22	1	544.96
23	1	433.49
24	1	1,486.12
25	2	822.42
42	1	931.01
53	1	 286.01
Total	12	\$ 7,004.41
Average Monthly Allowance		\$ 583.70
Average Age		24.7

#### Children - 1960 Plan



**SECTION C** 

**ACTUARIAL VALUATION PROCEDURES** 

## **Actuarial Cost Method**

The method used in this actuarial valuation is the Frozen Entry Age Actuarial Cost Method. This method determines a normal cost on an aggregate basis expressed as a level percentage of pay. The normal cost rate equals the ratio of (a) the present value of future benefits less the actuarial value of assets less the frozen unfunded actuarial liability, to (b) the present value of future salaries. Under this method, the actuarial gains (losses), as they occur, reduce (increase) future normal costs.

## **Amortization of Frozen Unfunded Accrued Liabilities**

Unfunded actuarial accrued liabilities attributable to changes in assumptions, plan provisions, or methods are amortized on a level dollar basis over 30 years from the creation of the unfunded base. A schedule of the frozen unfunded accrued liability amortization is shown in Section A of this report.

The total contribution is equal to the normal cost plus the amortization of the frozen unfunded accrued liabilities.

Existing frozen unfunded accrued liabilities are fully funded if the actuarial value of assets is greater than the present value of future benefits.

# **Actuarial Value of Assets**

The calculated value is determined by adjusting the market value of assets, excluding the future benefit fund, to reflect the investment gains and losses (the difference between the actual investment return and the expected investment return) during each of the last three years at a rate of 33 percent per year.



# **Actuarial Assumptions**

The Board adopts the assumptions after consultation with the actuary. All actuarial assumptions are expectations of future experience and are not market measures. The rationale for the actuarial assumptions may be found in the experience study report covering the period October 1, 2018, through September 30, 2022.

#### Interest

6.75 percent per year, compounded annually, net of investment and administrative expenses, annually.

## **General Inflation**

2.50 percent per year, compounded annually.

This assumption serves as the basis for the determination of annual increases that are equal to the annual increase in the Consumer Price Index-U during the preceding 12-month calendar year.

## Mortality

Mortality assumptions for employees and retirees are as follows:

Applicable Group	Base Mortality Table	
Pre-retirement	Pub-2010 Safety Employee, sex distinct	
Post-retirement	Pub-2010 Safety Healthy Retiree, sex distinct	
Post-disability	ost-disability Pub-2010 Safety Disabled Retiree, sex distinct	
Survivors	Pub-2010 Safety Contingent Survivor, sex distinct	

Future mortality improvements are reflected by projecting the base mortality tables forward from the year 2010 using the MP-2021 projection scale.

Illustrative rates are shown below.

	Sample Mortality Rates							
	Future Life Expectancy (years) in 2023			Future Life Expectancy (years) in 2035				
	Post-retirement		Disabled - Retiree		Post-retirement		Disabled - Retiree	
Age	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
35	51.15	53.35	49.03	51.40	52.22	54.35	50.31	52.61
40	45.90	48.07	44.06	46.37	46.96	49.07	45.28	47.55
45	40.70	42.82	39.11	41.36	41.74	43.81	40.28	42.50
50	35.57	37.61	34.17	36.35	36.59	38.60	35.31	37.47
55	30.51	32.50	29.31	31.45	31.51	33.48	30.41	32.54
60	25.63	27.58	24.62	26.82	26.59	28.53	25.66	27.84
65	21.02	22.93	20.26	22.48	21.90	23.79	21.19	23.37
70	16.73	18.54	16.22	18.34	17.49	19.29	17.01	19.10
75	12.82	14.47	12.50	14.43	13.44	15.10	13.14	15.07



### Termination

Rates of separation are represented by the following table. This assumption measures the probabilities of members terminating employment.

Employee Withdrawal Rate Per 1,000 Employees		
Years of Service	Number of Withdrawals	
0	75.0	
1	100.0	
2	50.0	
3	50.0	
4	22.5	
5	12.5	
6	12.5	
7	12.5	
8	12.5	
9	12.5	
10	12.5	
11	12.5	
12	12.5	
13	12.5	
14	12.5	
15	10.0	
16	5.0	
17	5.0	
18	5.0	
19	5.0	
20 or more	0.0	

It is assumed that terminated employees will not be rehired. The rates do not apply to members eligible to retire and do not include separation on account of death or disability.



#### Salary Increases

This assumption is used to project a member's current salary for purposes of determining the present value of future salaries. Because FRS benefits have been frozen as of February 1, 2013, this assumption is not used to determine benefits.

Illustrative rates of increase per individual employee per year, compounded annually:

Salary Increase Assumptions For an Individual Member		
Sample Increase		
Service	Next Year	
0	6.25%	
1	6.25%	
2	6.25%	
3	6.25%	
4	6.25%	
5	5.50%	
6	5.50%	
7	5.50%	
8	5.50%	
9	5.50%	
10	3.25%	
11	3.25%	
12	3.25%	
13	3.25%	
14	3.25%	
15	3.25%	
16	3.25%	
17	3.25%	
18	3.25%	
19	3.25%	
20	3.25%	
21	3.25%	
22	3.25%	
23	3.25%	
24	3.25%	
25	3.00%	
26	3.00%	
27	3.00%	
28	3.00%	
29	3.00%	
30 or more	2.75%	

The underlying salary increase assumption is based on a wage inflation assumption of 2.75 percent per year, comprised of 2.50 percent for general inflation plus 0.25 percent for productivity increases. The rates shown above include wage inflation plus an age-based component for merit, promotion, and longevity. Salary increase rates are based on the salary rates used by FRP which were updated in an experience study for the period October 1, 2017, through September 30, 2022, performed by the actuary for FRP (Cheiron).



## Disability

The rates of disability for active members are broken out between ordinary and accidental disability. Ordinary disability accounts for 15 percent of total disabilities and accidental disability accounts for 85 percent of total disabilities. Illustrative rates of disability from the plan are as follows for members:

Employee Disablement Number Per 1,000 Employees			
Age	Ordinary	Accidental	
25	0.38	2.13	
30	0.75	4.25	
35	0.75	4.25	
40	0.75	4.25	
45	0.75	4.25	
50	0.75	4.25	
55	0.75	4.25	
60	0.75	4.25	

Rates of disability are based on the disability rates used by FRP which were updated in an experience study for the period October 1, 2017, through September 30, 2022, performed by the actuary for FRP (Cheiron).



## Retirement

Employees are assumed to retire in accordance with the rates shown below. The rates apply only to employees who have fulfilled the service requirement necessary for retirement at any given age.

Rates of Retirement		
Years of Service	Rate of Retirement	
20	5.00 %	
21	2.00	
22	2.00	
23	2.00	
24	2.00	
25	6.00	
26	4.00	
27	4.00	
28	4.00	
29	4.00	
30	8.00	
31	6.00	
32	6.00	
33	6.00	
34	12.50	
35	75.00	
36	75.00	
37	75.00	
38	75.00	
39	75.00	
40 or more	100.00	

100 percent retirement assumed at age 70

It is assumed that grandfathered members with less than 20 years of service as of February 1, 2013, will not retire prior to age 50. The retirement rates for ages 50 to 54 for these members are 2.50 percent. The retirement rates for the year the member first becomes eligible for an unreduced FRP benefit at age 55 are 2 times the rate of retirement shown above.



### **DROP Benefits**

Members are assumed to enter the DROP with 27 years of service. If the member has more than 27 years of service at the actuarial valuation date, the member is assumed to enter the DROP the following year. Members with less than 20 years of service as of February 1, 2013, are assumed to enter the DROP at the later of 27 years of service or age 55.

Members who enter the DROP with less than 35 years of service are assumed to return to active status after completing five years in the DROP.

DROP balances are assumed to earn 6.75 percent per year.

DROP distribution rates for current retired members with DROP balances:

- 5.00 percent distribution per year from retirement age to age 72;
- 5.50 percent distribution at age 73 increasing by 0.50 percent per year to 11.00 percent at age 84; and
- 12.00 percent at age 85 increasing by 1.00 percent per year.

The DROP distribution rates assumed for current beneficiaries with DROP balances are the same as the DROP distribution rates for current retired members with age calculated using the deceased member's date of birth.

DROP distribution rates for members who retire in the future with DROP balances are based on a uniform 30-year distribution rate upon retirement.

If a member with a DROP balance dies prior to termination of employment, it is assumed that the DROP balance distribution is based on a uniform 30-year distribution rate upon death, payable to the beneficiary or the member's estate.

Pursuant to BB109, it is assumed that DROP benefits do not include salary increases after February 1, 2013.



### **Sick Leave Benefits**

In 2010, the City of St. Louis passed ordinances 67845 and 67846, which effectively ended the practice of firefighters accruing sick leave for retirement benefit purposes. Sick leave accrued prior to September 26, 2010, can still be used for retirement benefit purposes. Based on the 2015 Settlement between FRS and the City, the accrued sick leave balance as of February 1, 2013, can be converted to a pension benefit upon retirement.

The frozen sick leave balance as of February 1, 2013, is assumed to be utilized by the member at a rate of 1.5 percent per year.

Members are assumed to convert unused sick leave balances at retirement into a pension benefit and receive:

- 50 percent of the value as a lump sum deposit into the DROP account;
- 25 percent as service added to the credited service used in the calculation of the retirement benefit; and
- 25 percent of the value as additional pay solely for purposes of determining the final average earnings used in the calculation of the retirement benefit.

Pursuant to BB109, and subsequent settlement agreements, it is assumed that sick leave benefits do not include salary increases after February 1, 2013.

#### **Marriage Assumption**

100.0 percent of active participants are assumed to be married. Actual marital status at benefit commencement is used for retirees.

# Spouse's Age

For members whose spouse information is not provided, the female spouse is assumed to be three years younger than the male spouse for valuation purposes.

#### **Shift Differential**

No assumption is made for shift differential because it was removed for active members for City fiscal year ending June 30, 2011, and is not expected to be reinstated.

#### **Administrative Expenses**

Administrative expenses are assumed to be approximately 25 basis points.

#### **Decrement Timing**

All decrements are assumed to occur mid-year.



# **Decrement Relativity**

Decrement rates are used directly from the experience study, without adjustment for multiple decrement table effects.

#### **Decrement Operation**

Turnover decrements do not operate after a member reaches retirement eligibility.

## **Eligibility Testing**

Eligibility for benefits is determined based upon the age nearest birthday and service on the date the decrement is assumed to occur.

# 415(b) and 401(a)(17) Limits

No explicit assumption is made with respect to these items.

#### **Missing Data**

Payroll provided for plan year end September 30, 2023, only contained six months of pay. For valuation purposes, we approximated payroll for the year by multiplying the payroll provided by 2.



The Retirement System was revised effective January 1, 1960, under Ordinance 49623.

Prior to January 1, 1960, there were two groups of members, one group referred to as "Old Plan" and the other group as "New Plan." There is no longer a need for this separation in the active members because the revised system makes no distinction between the "Old Plan" members and the "New Plan" members. The retirees are divided into Old Plan, 1944 Plan (New Plan), and 1960 Plan (Ordinance 49623).

## **Provisions Attributable to Board Bill 109**

First effective with the actuarial valuation as of October 1, 2013, the actuarial valuation reflects the changes attributable to Ordinance 69245, Ordinance 69353, and Judge Dierker's subsequent ruling (Board Bill 109 or BB109). Our understanding of the key changes to the FRS is as follows:

- FRS is frozen as of February 1, 2013. That is, benefits paid from FRS will be based on the member's service and salary earned as of February 1, 2013. Participants with benefit service in FRS are classified as "grandfathered" members.
- Firefighters hired after February 1, 2013, are not members of FRS.
- Vesting and eligibility service earned after February 1, 2013, in the newly established Firemen's Retirement Plan of St. Louis (FRP) will count towards vesting and eligibility service in FRS.
- Ancillary benefits, for pre-retirement death or disability occurring after February 1, 2013, are assumed to be paid from the newly established FRP. FRS members who become disabled or die before retirement are eligible for a refund of contributions made to FRS.
- Employer contributions to the frozen FRS will continue to be calculated under the Frozen Initial Liability cost method.
- Member contributions after February 1, 2013, from "grandfathered" participants in FRS will be paid to the FRP.
- Grandfathered members with 20 or more years of service as of February 1, 2013, are eligible to retire with unreduced FRP benefits if retirement commences before age 55.
- Grandfathered members with less than 20 years of service as of February 1, 2013, are eligible to retire with actuarially reduced FRP benefits if retirement commences before age 55.

# **Service Retirement**

Retirements after June 3, 1978: Voluntary retirement after 20 or more years of service. The monthly retirement allowance consists of 40 percent of the final two-year average monthly compensation at 20 years of service, plus 2.0 percent of such final average compensation for each of the next five years of service (50 percent of final average compensation after 25 years of service), plus 4.0 percent of such final average compensation for each additional year of service over 25 years, but with a maximum of 30 years (70 percent of final average compensation after 30 years of service).

Effective October 3, 1982, any retired firefighter may act as a special advisor to the retirement system and thereby be entitled to a minimum pension of \$350.00 per month.

Effective October 1, 1989, any unused accrued sick leave will be added to the years of service used to determine the monthly pension allowance. If the total years of service are limited to 30 years as described above, the unused accrued sick leave will be added to 30.



# **Summary of Plan Provisions**

Effective November 28, 1995, the monthly retirement allowance consists of 40 percent of the final twoyear average monthly compensation at 20 years of service, plus 2.0 percent of such final average compensation for each of the next five years of service (50 percent of final average compensation after 25 years of service), plus 5.0 percent of such final average compensation for each additional year of service over 25 years, but with a maximum of 30 years (75 percent of final average compensation after 30 years of service).

Effective July 1, 2002, a Member has three options for use of unused sick leave and service retirement:

- Receive 100 percent of the value (sick leave multiplied by rate of pay) as a lump sum deposit into the DROP account;
- Receive 100 percent of the sick leave as service added to the credited service used in the calculation of the retirement benefit; or
- Receive 50 percent of the value as a lump sum deposit into the DROP account, and receive 25 percent as service added to the credited service used in the calculation of the retirement benefit and receive 25 percent of the value as additional pay solely for purposes of determining the final average earnings used in the calculation of the retirement benefit.

In 2010, the City of St. Louis passed ordinances 67845 and 67846, which effectively ended the practice of firefighters accruing sick leave for retirement benefit purposes. Sick leave accrued prior to September 26, 2010, can be converted to a pension benefit at retirement.

As part of the 2015 Settlement Agreement, accrued sick leave earned through February 1, 2013, can be converted to a pension benefit at retirement.

# **Ordinary Disability Retirement**

Provides a service retirement allowance if 20 or more years of service. Provides for a monthly retirement allowance after five years of service (but less than 20 years) which is the largest of (a) 90 percent of the monthly service retirement allowance based on the actual service or (b) one-fourth of the final two-year average monthly compensation. In addition, a monthly benefit of 10 percent of the final two-year average monthly compensation, for each unmarried dependent child under age 18, but not in excess of three children, is provided.

Benefits are paid by FRS if disability occurred prior to February 1, 2013.



#### **Accidental Disability Retirement**

Provides for retirement if the member is totally and permanently incapacitated for duty as the result of an accident or exposure occurring while in the actual performance of duty. The monthly retirement allowance is 75 percent of the highest monthly salary in effect for the highest step in the range of salary, for his rank held at retirement.

If the accident immediately, totally, and permanently incapacitates the member from performing any type of work and confines the member to his home, the Board may provide an increased retirement allowance not to exceed 100 percent of the member's actual rate of compensation as of the date his disability allowance began.

Benefits are paid by FRS if disability occurred prior to February 1, 2013.

#### **DROP Benefit**

A member eligible for service retirement may defer receipt of the service retirement benefit for up to five years while continuing active employment. Contributions by the member while in the DROP are one percent of annual compensation. The amount the member would have received as a service retirement benefit is deposited into the DROP account. A member terminating the DROP plan may retire or continue active service. Service while in the DROP will not count as creditable service. Upon termination of employment, the member may choose to receive the DROP account with the interest earned by the account.

# **Ordinary Death Benefit**

Provides for the following benefits after death which occurs:

- (1) While in service, a monthly retirement allowance to the widow during widowhood of the greater of (1) 50 percent<sup>a</sup> of the final two-year average monthly compensation or (2) \$200. In addition, 10 percent of each unmarried dependent child under age 18 in her care, but not in excess of three children. Benefits are paid by FRS if death occurred prior to February 1, 2013.
- (2) After service retirement, accidental disability retirement or ordinary disability retirement, a monthly allowance to the widow during widowhood of the greater of (1) 50 percent<sup>a</sup> of the final two-year average monthly compensation, or (2) \$200. In addition, 10 percent of such compensation for each unmarried dependent child under eighteen in her care but not in excess of three children. Benefits are paid by FRS if retirement occurred prior to February 1, 2013.

<sup>a</sup> Assumes the widow has applied for and been appointed to the status of special consultant; if not, the amount is 25 percent.



#### Accidental Death Benefit

Provides, if death is the result of an accident or exposure while in the actual performance of duty, a monthly allowance to the widow during her widowhood of the greater of (1) 50 percent of the final twoyear average monthly compensation or (2) \$200. In addition, 10 percent for each unmarried dependent child under 18 in her care but not in excess of three children. **Benefits are paid by FRS if death occurred prior to February 1, 2013.** 

#### \$2,000 Lump Sum Death Benefit

Provides a \$2,000 lump sum amount upon the death of an active or retired member. Lump sum death benefits are paid by FRS if retirement occurred prior to February 1, 2013, or if pre-retirement death occurred prior to February 1, 2013.

#### **Cost-of-Living Adjustments**

(Ordinance 56444) Retirement allowances to members who retired after March 16, 1973, and prior to December 28, 1983, shall be increased 3.0 percent whenever the Consumer Price Index released by the U.S. Department of Labor shows an increase of at least 3.0 percent for three consecutive months in the preceding twelve-month period. Prior to August 31, 1980, each increase was applied to the base retirement benefit at time of retirement. Commencing August 31, 1980, the cost-of-living adjustment is made to the current retirement benefit.

Ordinance 59018 changed the cost-of-living provision for anyone retiring after December 28, 1983. For those members who retired subsequent to December 28, 1983, the cost-of-living increases for service or ordinary disability retirement are based upon the number of years of service at retirement, and are subject to a maximum of the actual increase in the Consumer Price Index over the most recent 12 months.

For a member with less than 25 years of service at retirement, the cost-of-living is 1.5 percent per year up to age 60 and 5.0 percent per year after age 60 with a 25 percent maximum applied past age 60. For a member with at least 25 years of service but less than 30 years at retirement, the cost-of-living increase is 2.25 percent per year up to age 60 and 5.0 percent per year after age 60 with a 25 percent maximum applied past age 60. For a member with 30 or more years of service at retirement, the cost-of-living increase is 3.0 percent per year up to age 60 and 5.0 percent per year after age 60 with a 25 percent maximum applied past age 60. For a member with 30 or more years of service at retirement, the cost-of-living increase is 3.0 percent per year up to age 60 and 5.0 percent per year after age 60 with a 25 percent maximum applied past age 60. For a member who retires at age 60 or later, the cost-of-living increase is 5.0 percent per year with a 25 percent maximum applied.

For a member who retires with an accidental disability retirement, the cost-of-living increase is 3.0 percent per year up to age 60 and 5.0 percent per year after age 60 with a 25 percent maximum applied past age 60.



#### **Return of Contributions**

Upon service retirement, ordinary disability, accidental disability, or death of an active member, contributions without interest are refunded. Upon withdrawal from service of a member prior to eligibility for a service retirement allowance, the entire amount of the member's contributions with interest accumulated is returned to the member in lieu of any other benefits.

